

SMAC Ranking Committee Overview of Scoring/Ranking Process

The following describes the process used by the SMAC ranking committee to score and rank projects for 2013 CoC funding. It should be noted that the Ranking Committee used “scoring” and “ranking” as two distinct steps. Scoring informed but did not dictate the final ranking decisions. Where ranking and scoring did not correlate, the Ranking Committee provided comments to indicate why the project was ranked in their position.

- 12/20/13 Project Applications due to SMAC coordinators
- 12/20-12/30 MESH and State CoC Team conduct technical review of Project Applications and conduct initial scoring. In addition to project applications, the following items were used to inform scoring:
- Project APRs
 - Organizational Audit
 - Recent HUD audits and findings
 - LOCCS Drawdown and unspent funds
 - Project Educational and Early Childhood documents (families/youth)
- 12/30-1/8 Projects were invited to amend applications based upon initial scoring. Ranking committee conducted one-one interviews which each program to clarify any concerns and to make recommendations to improving scoring. Amended applications were reviewed and scoring was adjusted.
- 1/9 Ranking Committee Meeting #1
- In Attendance: Courtney Knoll, Dana Scarlett, Jenny Green, Pat Leary, Jane Lawrenz, Barbara Williams, Mallory Birch, Mike Manhard, Loni Aadalen
 - Process
 - Confirmed scoring of SMAC projects
 - Reviewed “site visit” highlights – any items that might suggest ranking should be different than scoring.
 - Final scoring was determined.
- 1/9-1/13 In between meetings we solicited to all programs to see if they could make voluntary adjustments to their grant (without reducing beds) to help us reach 95% ARA in tier 1. The following organizations volunteered to reduce their grants:
- Wilder HMIS Offered to reduce by \$8,000 (this offer was rejected to align with HUD’s priority to fund HMIS)
 - Washington HRA Offered to reduce by \$18,428 (this offer was changed to reduce by \$16,209 for total grant request of \$218,511)
 - Dakota CDA Offered to reduce by \$15,168 (this offer was changed to reduce by \$12,688 for total grant request of \$206,000)
 - Commonbond Offered to reduce by \$1,408 (this offer was accepted)
 - People Inc Opted to NOT renew their grant of \$66,256 (this was an agency decision for which the Ranking Committee had no role. The Ranking Committee did talk directly with the program to ensure that this was their final decision and that their program could still sustain without HUD funds.

1/13

Ranking Committee Meeting #2

- In Attendance: Courtney Knoll, Dana Scarlett, Jenny Green, Pat Leary, Jane Lawrenz, Barbara Williams, Mallory Birch, Mike Manhard, Loni Aadalen (phone)
- Process
 - Reviewed new Applications to determine if they warrant inclusion in Tier 1 or Tier 2
 - Reviewed projects that scored in the bottom third of all renewal projects. Options considered include one or more of the following:
 - Tier 1
 - Tier 2
 - % cut
 - Reject the application
 - Reviewed options for top two thirds of scores. Same options applied.
 - Finalized SMAC ranking for Tier 1 and Tier 2 approved by ranking committee

1/13 RANKING MOTION

Motion—Dana

2nd—Mallory

Motion carries.

Motion to approve ranking as written with Tier 1 consisting of:

Rank	Agency	Project	Amount
1	Scott-Carver-Dakota CAP Agency	Dakota PSH Bryant	\$ 23,762
2	Scott-Carver-Dakota CAP Agency	Pro Rata/Bonus Leasing Combo 2011	\$ 71,173
3	Mental Health Resources, Inc.	Project Restore	\$ 175,474
4	CommonBond Communities	Granda Lakes Supportive Housing	\$ 16,985
5	Carver CDA	Carver CDA S+C	\$ 76,704
6	Washington County HRA	HomeFree 2010	\$ 218,511
7	Metropolitan Council, Minnesota	Anoka County Shelter + Care Program	\$ 230,208
8	Supportive Housing and Managed Care Pilot, aka Hearth Connection	Hearth SMAC Leasing	\$ 97,792
9	County of Scott	H238	\$ 167,280
10	Dakota County CDA	S+C 2013	\$ 206,000
11	South Metro Human Services	2011 SMAC RA renewal	\$ 49,132
12	Scott-Carver-Dakota CAP Agency	Scott/Carver Transitional Housing 2011	\$ 152,768
13	Canvas Health	SHARE 2011	\$ 52,701
14	Mental Health Resources, Inc.	Permanent Housing for Chronically Homeless Disabled Adults	\$ 26,770
15	Elim Transitional Housing, Inc.	Anoka Dakota SHP/Samaritan (Lutheran Social Services) Anoka PSH	\$ 229,715
16	Human Services, Inc., in Washington County Minnesota	Mosaic 2013	\$ 41,874
17	The Link	Lincoln Place 2013	\$ 51,029
18	Dakota County	Supportive Housing Program	\$ 410,850
19	Wilder Foundation	HMIS SMAC (MN0072B5K031003)	\$ 107,498
TOTAL			\$ 2,406,226

Tier 2 consisting of:

Rank	Agency	Project	Reject
20	Safehaven ¹	SH Project 2013	\$ 26,889
21	South Metro Human Services	SMAC RA 2013	\$ 54,885
22	Hearth Connection	NEW SMAC RA 2013	\$ 44,870
TOTAL			\$ 126,644

1/14-15 All Applicants were contacted to be informed of their ranking position, including any amendments needed to their project application prior to submission.

1/15 Mike Manhard received a call from Michele Smith of HUD after 5pm. Michele indicated that, contrary to earlier guidance, the 2012 planning grant amount must be included as part of the CoC annual renewal demand (both in Tier 1 and Tier 2). This means that an additional \$31,227 must be added to Tier 1 AND an additional \$1,644 must be added to Tier 2 for a total CoC annual renewal amount of \$2,565,651.

1/16 An emergency conference call meeting is held to consider how to incorporate and rank the inclusion of the ranking grant. Options included:

- Ranking the planning grant in Tier 1 and splitting \$1,644 between the two new projects
- Ranking the planning grant in Tier 2 and moving one of the new projects or Safehaven up to Tier 1.
- Rejecting the planning grant and funding Tier 1 and Tier 2 accordingly.

The Ranking Committee opted to move the planning grant to Tier 2 and move Hearth Connection up to Tier 1 at a reduced amount (\$31,227).

Motion—Dana

2nd—Don

Motion Carries.

Other notes from the Ranking Committee:

- The FINAL motion regarding ranking and tiering had amounts that Washington HRA and Dakota CDA could not match exactly. The amounts not spent by these grants were moved to Commonbond's project to reduce the amount this project needed to voluntarily cut.
- The Link believed that their income/employment scoring was not recorded correctly. This was not able to be addressed in "site visit" phone calls since The Link's APR was submitted/due during the SMAC ranking process, thus the scoring occurred after site visits. Since the ranking/tiering is final, the SMAC ranking committee will not revise scores and ranking at this point. The application is safely within Tier 1. The discrepancy has been noted and should be factored into application reviews next year (i.e. they shouldn't be penalized for having historic underperformance).
- Recommend to revise and improve SMAC's ability to collect and evaluate educational outcomes.
- All 2013 projects chose "total income" as their measure. They need to know that "earned income" is still a measure that requires CoC high performance. Recommend to create a workgroup to improve employment outcomes.
- There is inconsistency with Data Quality—especially with SSN. Recommend regional provider discussions occur to improve overall SMAC performance.
- Discussed problem with penalizing providers for past unspent funds errors. Recommend that ranking committee of future years look at three year trend for unspent funds. (don't penalize forever).

¹ The Ranking Committee decided (as part of this motion) that should Safehaven's final project application include \$0 for leverage, their application will be rejected and their grant amount of \$26,889 will be split in Tier 2 between South Metro and Hearth Connection new applications. Safehaven was later able to add leverage.

FINAL RANKING ORDER

TIER 1

Rank	Agency	Project	Amount
1	Scott-Carver-Dakota CAP Agency	Dakota PSH Bryant	\$ 23,762
2	Scott-Carver-Dakota CAP Agency	Pro Rata/Bonus Leasing Combo 2011	\$ 71,173
3	Mental Health Resources, Inc.	Project Restore	\$ 175,474
4	CommonBond Communities	Granda Lakes Supportive Housing	\$ 17,601
5	Carver CDA	Carver CDA S+C	\$ 76,704
6	Washington County HRA	HomeFree 2010	\$ 217,920
7	Metropolitan Council, Minnesota	Anoka County Shelter + Care Program	\$ 230,208
8	Supportive Housing and Managed Care Pilot, aka Hearth Connection	Hearth SMAC Leasing	\$ 97,792
9	County of Scott	H238	\$ 167,280
10	Dakota County CDA	S+C 2013	\$ 205,980
11	South Metro Human Services	2011 SMAC RA renewal	\$ 49,132
12	Scott-Carver-Dakota CAP Agency	Scott/Carver Transitional Housing 2011	\$ 152,768
13	Canvas Health	SHARE 2011	\$ 52,701
14	Mental Health Resources, Inc.	Permanent Housing for Chronically Homeless Disabled Adults	\$ 26,770
15	Elim Transitional Housing, Inc.	Anoka Dakota SHP/Samaritan (Lutheran Social Services) Anoka PSH	\$ 229,715
16	Human Services, Inc., in Washington County Minnesota	Mosaic 2013	\$ 41,874
17	The Link	Lincoln Place 2013	\$ 51,029
18	Dakota County	Supportive Housing Program	\$ 410,850
19	Hearth Connection	New SMAC RA	\$ 31,227
20	Wilder Foundation	HMIS SMAC (MN0072B5K031003)	\$ 107,498
TOTAL			\$ 2,437,368

Tier 2 consisting of:

Rank	Agency	Project	Reject
21	Safehaven ²	SH Project 2013	\$ 26,889
22	South Metro Human Services	SMAC RA 2013	\$ 54,885
23	Washington County	New Planning Grant	\$ 32,871
TOTAL			\$ 128,283

² The Ranking Committee decided (as part of this motion) that should Safehaven's final project application include \$0 for leverage, their application will be rejected and their grant amount of \$26,889 will be split in Tier 2 between South Metro and Hearth Connection new applications.